Published by the decision of the Scientific Council
of Khachatur Abovian
Armenian State Pedagogical University

Department of Philosophy and Logic
named after Academician Georg Brutian

W I S D O M

4(28), 2023

ASPU Publication
YEREVAN – 2023
THE POLITICAL IMPACT OF DIGITALIZATION ON THE JUDICIAL METHOD OF PROTECTION OF RIGHTS IN THE EAEU COUNTRIES

Ekaterina RUSAKOVA 1,*

1 Law Institute, Peoples’ Friendship University of Russia after Patrice Lumumba (RUDN University), Moscow, Russia

* Correspondence
Ekaterina RUSAKOVA, 6, Miklukho-Maklaya st., Moscow, 117198, Russia
E-mail: rusakova-ep@rudn.ru

Abstract: The article is devoted to the study of the process of digital transformation of the judicial method of protecting rights and legitimate interests in the EAEU countries. The judicial form of protection of rights has undergone fundamental changes as one of the main forms of protection of the rights and legitimate interests of citizens and business entities through the creation of digital platforms, electronic courts and the integration of information and telecommunication technologies into the process of consideration and resolution of disputes. For effective legal regulation of public relations arising under the influence of digital technologies in the course of judicial proceedings, it is necessary to theoretically develop the concept of a new type – “electronic” civil proceedings and improve the current legislation. In world practice, there are already a number of countries and integration associations that have successfully integrated digital and electronic legal proceedings, so some EAEU countries have taken the path of borrowing their positive experience.

Keywords: e-court, e-litigation, e-CELL, e-mediation, legislation, Russia, Armenia, Kazakhstan, Kyrgyzstan, Belorussia.

Introduction

Digital transformation of public relations within the framework of economic integration is an unprecedented condition for the development of the common market of the EAEU countries. The transition to digital forms of communication between the participating countries increases the volume of electronic transactions concluded, and the use of innovative technologies creates a new reality for cross-border trade and investment climate (Miashechanava, 2022, pp. 79-91). Philosophical and theoretical analysis of modern society involves the introduction of a number of new categories that play an important role in cognition social phenomena and processes taking place directly in the field of artificial intelligence (Kosarenko, 2023, pp. 39-43). The advantage of this technology is the minimization of the human factor and the impact on this process, although no technology can completely eliminate the occurrence of disputes in the outside world.

The transformation of socio-economic and political-legal relations in the participating countries under the influence of end-to-end digital technologies has made it possible to identify fundamental problems and risks for
the integration of information and communication technologies throughout the economic space of the Union, especially during the sanctions policy of Western countries against a number of EAEU member states.

The process of creating a unified information space began in 2016, when the “Statement on the Digital Agenda of the EAEU” was signed, which contains the main principles of the digital agenda until 2025. In 2017, the Supreme Eurasian Economic Council, in its decision “On the main directions of the implementation of the Digital Agenda of the Eurasian Economic Union until 2025”, defined the meaning of the term “digital space of the Union” – a space integrating digital processes, means of digital interaction, information resources, as well as a set of digital infrastructures, based on regulatory norms, organization mechanisms, management and use. In all the EAEU member states, the rapid introduction of digital technologies into the public life of citizens is noticeable, often of an aggressive nature in the understanding of the latter, “planting” social relations with complex technologies. Of particular importance were the “digital” agendas adopted at the state level in the EAEU countries, which included, in addition to creating an electronic government, the digital economy also concerned the judicial system and judicial proceedings, in particular.

The EAEU member states, which are in the process of digitalization of economic relations, in order to reduce legal risks when creating and using information products in the innovation ecosystem, by determining the possible legal consequences of the use of digital technologies, should provide a transparent way to resolve emerging disputes. A universal way to protect rights and legitimate interests is judicial. In the context of the collision of the state and society with global challenges, there is a need to create institutions and mechanisms that ensure social and legal control, algorithmization based on digital platforms of political processes, etc. The introduction of digital technologies into the dispute settlement process between business entities is important not only for converting this method into an electronic format, but also for increasing its effectiveness.

Methodology

The theoretical and methodological basis of the research is the dialectical-materialistic method of cognition of social processes and socio-legal phenomena during the digital transformation of the judicial method of protection of rights. In particular, the dialectical-materialistic method will allow us to study the normative legal acts regulating the procedure for creating electronic justice and their impact on national legislation. The legal and sociological orientation of the work also determines the use of general scientific methods: generalization, abstraction, analysis, synthesis, induction, deduction, historical, logical, comparison, classification. Allowing to conduct a comprehensive study of the process of converting the judicial method into an electronic form in the EAEU countries. The process of digital transformation of judicial activity is carried out in all EAEU countries, however, in almost all this process is incomplete and requires both legal and technical support, taking into account the constant evolution of end-to-end digital technologies.

With the help of a systematic method, the distinctive features of electronic justice will be studied and identified. The use of the functional method and the logical method will allow to generalize the distinctive features of the process of formation of electronic justice in the EAEU countries. The forecasting method is a set of techniques that make it possible to make scientifically sound forecasts about future formations of challenges and threats, including the process of digital transformation of the judicial method of protecting rights. The method of legal modeling is used in the context of the formation and justification of the doctrinal and legal framework, individual regulatory provisions and other legal innovations necessary for the formation of an adequate and effective system of protection of rights in the EAEU countries in the context of ensuring national security. The formal legal method will make it possible to interpret the basic provisions and concepts contained in law, legal doctrine and law enforcement practice.
Main Study

More than 40 years ago, lawyer Mauro Cappeletti warned of a gap between civil justice and the complexity of modern society, which requires new methods of dispute resolution because traditional remedies do not meet the needs of society. Currently, the cooperation of the EAEU countries both within the union and with foreign partners is being transformed into multilateral cooperation, which will require the widespread introduction of digital technologies and their legal support (Frolova, 2020, pp. 673-694). In the current situation, it is simply necessary to guarantee the legal certainty of the position of participants in the process of digitalization of economic relations of the EAEU member states in order to reduce legal risks when creating and using information products in the financial and business sectors by determining the possible legal consequences of the use of digital technologies.

The digital agenda adopted by the Member States assumes a radical transformation of all industries involved in cross-industry processes, the development of digital infrastructures, digital platforms, makes it necessary to create transparent ways to resolve disputes arising from the emergence of new objects of digital rights (Kozhokar & Rusakova, 2023, pp. 121-141).

Specific current examples of the transformation of public relations in terms of philosophy illustrate the creation of a new national architecture for the provision of digital services through a comprehensive transformation of this area on the basis of a single digital space.

Highlighting the positive and negative features of digital justice, we can note the lack of unity in assessing this phenomenon of legal reality:

- one of the positive features of digital justice is the implementation of the principle of "rule of law". Increasing citizens' confidence in justice is achieved due to the strict observance of the norms of the law by the courts and the absence of any impact on their activities;
- observance of the principle of inclusiveness within the framework of digital justice can be considered as one of the social guarantees of the rule of law, when any person, in the broad sense of the word, can apply to the court for his protection.

Currently, various state programs regulating the process of digital transformation of society are being implemented in all member States. Thus, the Russian Federation has adopted: Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 204 dated May 7, 2018 “On National goals and strategic objectives of the Development of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2024”; Strategy for the Development of the Information Society in the Russian Federation for 2017-2030 (approved by Decree of the President of the Russian Federation dated 09.05.2017 No. 203), “Passport of the national project “National Program “Digital Economy of the Russian Federation” (approved by the Presidium of the Presidential Council for Strategic Development and National Projects, Protocol No. 7 dated 04.06.2019) developed in order to ensure the implementation of the Decree of the President of the Russian Federation No. 474 dated July 21, 2020 “On National Development Goals of the Russian Federation for the period up to 2030”, which establishes the legal framework in the field of legal proceedings and notaries in the era of active development of the digital economy, namely: unification of the procedure for applying to the court and the notary, including in electronic form, as well as the admissibility of the use of electronic evidence; remote participation in a court session; development of electronic notary tools (production of notarial documents in electronic form, remote performance of notarial actions, etc.), including Federal Law No. 259-FZ of 31.07.2020 “On Digital Financial Assets, Digital Currency and on Amendments to Certain Legislative Acts of the Russian Federation” regulating the procedure for issuing, accounting and circulation of digital financial assets, as well as the activities of the information system operator.

In December 2017, the President of Belarus signed Decree No. 8 “On the development of the digital economy”, which establishes the legal foundations for the development of the digital economy. However, it should be noted that the process of digitalization began long before the adoption of this Decree, we are talking about the creation of a High-Tech Park (HTP) in 2005, as a result, smart contracts, blockchain and cryptocurrencies were legislatively regulated. HTP residents can provide crypto exchange services, as well as use cryptocurrencies and tokens based on blockchain technology in local and international civil circulation. Currently, Presidential Decree
No. 102 of April 12, 2023 “On the development of the Hi-Tech Park” has been adopted, which introduced into the HTP structure a management company representing HTP in cooperation with foreign partners to assist residents of the park in expanding exports and attracting investments. In addition, the resolution of the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Belarus of February 2, 2021 No. 66 “On the State Program “Digital Development of Belarus” for 2021-2025” establishes electronic legal communication between citizens, business and the state, and in all spheres of society, the creation of “smart cities”, and each of the directions of digital transformation involves a platform solution, both in relation to public services and economic spheres. The above acts also influenced the process of the emergence and development of electronic legal proceedings in the Republic of Belarus.

In 2017, the state program “Digital Kazakhstan” was adopted in the Republic of Kazakhstan and specific tasks of this program were set: “implementation of the digital Silk Road”, namely, the development of a creative society, the achievement of digital transformations in economic sectors, the transition to a proactive state. It should be noted that this state program is primarily aimed at improving the standard of living of citizens through the integration of digital technologies, the development of the digital economy. Another ambitious goal is to create an innovation ecosystem that develops technological entrepreneurship and innovation in cooperation with representatives of business, the scientific sphere and the state.

Since 2017, the Agenda of Armenia’s Digital Transformation until 2030 has been implemented in the Republic of Armenia, within the framework of which it is planned to implement six key directions: to create a digital state in which public administration will be carried out using digital technologies to increase the efficiency of administrative processes, accelerate management processes, strengthen control over these processes and reduce corruption risks; digital skills, infrastructure, cybersecurity, private sector and institutional frameworks. By 2030, Armenia plans to achieve 100% digitalization in the state – business relationship and 80% in the line of services to citizens. In addition, special agencies have been established in Armenia to manage the digital transformation of society and the economy, namely, the Information Systems Management Council and the Information Systems Agency.

In 2018, the National Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic for 2018-2040 was adopted, in which the directions of the country’s digital development were fixed, and the Concept “Digital Kyrgyzstan 2019-2023” was also developed, which provides for the provision of high-quality digital services, the prevention of corruption in the public administration system through the digital transformation of the state system, the creation of digital economic clusters, the improvement of the level of digital skills of citizens and others. However, seven goals of this Concept are fixed: the construction of digital infrastructure, the creation of a legal environment and institutions for the innovative development of society, the availability of digital services, the involvement of citizens in digital governance of the country, the formation of a digital society, the transformation of the country into a safe place to live and work online, the desire to become a regional hub of the digital Silk Road.

The “digital” agendas or development strategies adopted by the participating countries have had a dominant impact on the transformation of the judicial form of protection of rights into an electronic one. The deep integration of innovative technical means into legal proceedings, such as artificial intelligence, Big Data, blockchain and others, allowed us to talk about a qualitatively new form of obtaining judicial protection. However, in order for the digital agenda to be implemented, it is necessary to create a unified information space, improve legislation in this area, and ensure information security.

The leader of the EAEU countries in the creation of electronic justice is the Republic of Kazakhstan. In the Republic of Kazakhstan, back in 2014, a single Internet platform of judicial authorities was created on the website sud.gov.kz, which allows you to receive all information about the activities of courts in a single window mode, which is not only informative, but also practical. A single portal of judicial services, the capabilities of which allow participants in the process to carry out all procedural actions remotely, as well as to get acquainted with the case materials through the “judicial cabinet” (Burdina, 2021, pp. 49-53). “Judicial Cabinet” provides participants in court proceedings with the opportunity to use a wide range of services in a single
In addition, the Strategy of Information and Communication Technologies for the Judicial System of the Republic of Kazakhstan has been adopted and is being implemented, which is of key importance for the development of the entire judicial system and the transition to electronic justice. This strategy includes four directions and 26 tasks. The first direction concerns the creation of an electronic courtroom, within the framework of which mobile videoconferencing has been introduced, the installation of self-service terminals in courtrooms, the development of the AVF system, increasing the accessibility of justice for people with disabilities, the equipment of special premises in courthouses. The second direction is “e-SOT in legal proceedings”, according to which, since 2016, the information and analytical system “Torelik” has been launched in all courts of the country, with the help of which automated accounting and control of compliance with procedural deadlines are carried out, statistical and analytical reports are generated, record keeping and legal proceedings are simplified by integrating artificial intelligence technologies, Big Data, blockchain, “IT learning”, “mobile-Torelik”. The third direction is called “e-CELL for the population”, within which the “service for checking the legitimacy of judicial acts”, the service for checking the availability of court cases and materials and the search reference and analytical service “e-Discovery” are integrated, as well as de-personalization of judicial acts, “online broadcast of court sessions”, “on-line online debates”, “e-notifications”, “e-Mediator”, “court-GIS”. The fourth direction concerns the creation of a new model of IT and information security management, which involves their improvement, ensuring their security, forming an organizational structure for data analysis within the framework of the Situation Center, creating a Change Management Council, developing a server platform of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Thus, according to A. K. Kukeev (2021), in the national judicial system, the result of the introduction of technologies into the proceedings is the creation and full functioning of the Automated information and Analytical system of the judicial bodies of the Republic of Kazakhstan “Torelik”, whose task is to provide the user with prompt access to the exchange of information data (pp. 261-271).

The website of the Supreme Court of the Republic of Kazakhstan provides the following data concerning the introduction of electronic justice: in 2014, only 5% of lawsuits were filed electronically, and now their number is 90% of all filed lawsuits. For 9 months of 2022, 900 thousand documents were submitted through the Judicial Cabinet, including more than 313 thousand claims, writ, special and other statements. In addition, the service of external users on the SmartBridge platform has implemented a special option with which the IT community can get access to current judicial acts, which is interested in developing predictive IT products so that people can assess their chances before going to court. The process of robotization of judges’ activities is in full swing, so the authorization of decisions of private bailiffs to restrict travel abroad, the registration of received case materials, the issuance of court orders on alimony obligations have already been fully automated. Judges have already been released from a number of actions that took a lot of time, so now they can concentrate on the most difficult cases.

The Russian Federation is one of the leaders among the EAEU member states in terms of the pace of creation of electronic justice. The “Concept of Information policy of the Judicial System for 2020-2030” adopted by the Council of Judges of the Russian Federation establishes the necessary foundations for the emergence and implementation of digital justice, the successful implementation of which contributes to increasing the level of trust of citizens and organizations in justice through the introduction of modern information and communication technologies, improving the technical equipment of courts, the operation of court websites and other state information systems. On February 15, 2021, by Order of the Chairman of the Supreme Court of the Russian Federation, the “Concept of Informatization of the Supreme Court of the Russian Federation” was approved, which establish-
es the new term “Justice Online”, which means the remote implementation by the court and/or one or all participants in the judicial process of all or individual procedural actions provided for by law through the use of information technology in the activities of courts. The main attention is paid to ensuring remote interaction of the participants in the process during the trial, ensuring information security, modernization of information systems (Kuznetsova, 2022, pp. 224-227).

In the Russian Federation, state automated information systems of electronic justice have been created: the automated information system of the Supreme Court of the Russian Federation, the state automated system “Justice”, “Judicial Proceedings”, “Judicial and Arbitration records management”, as well as information systems “Card File of arbitration cases”, “Bank of decisions of arbitration courts”. However, in order to carry out procedural actions in electronic form, users must create a personal account (Rusakova & Frolova, 2022, pp. 143-153).

It should be noted that the idea of creating e-justice is being gradually implemented through the regulatory regulation of new institutions that have emerged as a result of the transformation of the form of justice. New rules concerning electronic justice are being introduced into the procedural codes (Kudryavtseva, 2021, pp. 10-13). Thus, changes were made to the Commercial procedure and Civil procedure codes regarding the form of documents. Currently, a statement of claim, complaint, submission and other documents can be submitted in the form of an electronic document, and participants in the process can also send documents to the court in electronic form. In addition, the testimony of witnesses, explanations of persons involved in the case, can be made via video conference or web conference. The procedure for proper notification of the parties about the trial has been significantly simplified, now the court notice is sent electronically via a single portal of state and municipal services or an electronic document management system of a participant in the process using a single system of interdepartmental electronic interaction, and the court, in turn, places all the necessary information about the course of the trial in accordance with the established procedure on the Internet information and telecommunications network.

According to the “Concept of development of machine-readable law technologies” (approved by The Government Commission on Digital Development, the Use of Information technologies to improve the quality of life and business Conditions, Protocol No. 31 dated 09/15/2021) plans to integrate an electronic machine-readable document flow into the work of judges, which will automate the process of passing a court case and create a full-text electronic bank of court decisions (Bashilov & Berman, 2022, pp. 261-270). The main goal of the concept is to introduce an “electronic case” into Russian legal proceedings, on the basis of which unified templates of court decisions, a statement of claim constructor, as well as a system for analyzing judicial practice will be integrated.

The introduction of digital technologies makes it necessary to consolidate new legal foundations in legislation. The procedural reform carried out in the Russian Federation contains provisions related to the integration of modern digital technologies into the process. However, in judicial practice there are many controversial issues related to their use and evaluation by the court. At the same time, the procedure for carrying out procedural actions using digital technical means needs to be changed in the direction of simplification. The concept of creating electronic justice in the Russian Federation has not yet been implemented and is at the stage of formation.

The initiator of the creation of electronic justice was the Supreme Economic Court, which already in 2009 introduced a number of electronic actions into its activities: submission of electronic copies of documents, electronic schedule of court sessions, placement of the operative part of the decisions of the cassation instance online on the portal of economic courts of the Republic of Belarus, audio, video recording of court sessions. In 2011, the Economic Procedural Code was amended regarding the possibility of applying to the court in electronic form.

The beginning of the formation of electronic justice began in two directions: the creation of websites with e-mail for regional courts, except for the Minsk City Court and the Supreme Court, and the legislative consolidation of the prospects for the development of general courts (Fedotov, 2012).

Since 2019, when working with the “Electronic Court Proceedings” (“E-COURT”) services on the Internet portal of courts of general jurisdiction, the software of the EDS technology (electronic digital signature) has been put into test operation, which provided users of the “E-COURT” services with the opportunity to submit documents signed by EDS, provides reliable identification of persons, applying to the court, creates prerequisites for the further development of the service and the formation of a full-fledged electronic case in the future (Guryeva, 2022, pp. 91-97). In 2021, a unified computer system was put into operation, uniting all the courts of the Republic of Belarus, the automated information system of courts of general jurisdiction AIS SOY was modernized, allowing automated accounting of cases of all categories (from the moment of receipt of the application to the resolution on the merits and further), as well as receiving information about the movement of almost every specific court case (Leshkevich, n.d.). The scientific development of issues of the formation of electronic legal proceedings in the civil process of the Republic of Belarus is a prerequisite for improving the availability of legal aid to the population of the country, and on the other hand, contributes to strengthening the rule of law and the rule of law (Stepanov, 2018). The ongoing changes in the judicial process indicate that the task of creating e-justice is strategically important to ensure leadership in this area.

The Republic of Armenia has started the process of state management of informatization since 2000 and in 2014 the “Strategic Program for the Development of Electronic Government” for 2014-2018, approved by Government Resolution No. 14 of April 10, 2014, as well as the “Strategic Program for the Long-term Development of the Republic of Armenia for 2014-2025”, approved by Government Resolution No. 14 of March 2014, were adopted. 442-N. As for the process of creating e-justice, in 2019, the Republic of Armenia began two-year work on a project for the development and implementation of e-justice solutions. Within the framework of which it was planned to create a single e-justice platform that would allow users to receive all the necessary information in a single window. The e-justice platform will transform all procedural actions of participants in legal proceedings into a digital format, as well as make unhindered access to justice and new electronic services. In addition, the Reform Strategy of the Republic of Armenia was adopted, in which the modernization of the judicial system 2019 - 2023 is a strategic direction (Hakobjanyan, 2022, pp. 31-35). Thus, in Armenia, writ production has already been fully automated, and local domestic e-justice software is also being tested. In addition, an electronic platform “Personal Account” has been introduced on the website of the Executive Service, where, having registered, citizens and legal entities can get acquainted with the initiated enforcement proceedings: sanctions, payments, tracking of funds in the process of withdrawal of funds and other property and termination of enforcement proceedings. Currently, work is underway on a project for the implementation of the bankruptcy procedure in electronic form.

Work on the creation of electronic justice in the Kyrgyz Republic began quite a long time ago, some authors believe since 20002 (Semirov, 2022, pp. 104-110), when the National Human Rights Program for the period 2002-2010 was adopted. In addition, in 2012, by the Decree of the President of the Kyrgyz Republic “On measures to improve justice in the Kyrgyz Republic”, the state automated system of judicial information and management “Justice” (GAS “Adilet Sot”) was integrated in all courts of the country, as well as audio and video protocols, video conferencing, electronic document management. In 2019, the relevant amendments were made to the Law “On the status of Bailiffs and
enforcement proceedings”, now you can check on the website the presence or absence of initiated enforcement proceedings against a person. In addition, the National Development Strategy of the Kyrgyz Republic for 2018-2040 has been adopted, which also addresses issues related to the digital transformation of the judicial method of protecting rights. According to N. S. Semenov, in addition to the positive aspects associated with the introduction of electronic justice, there are still unresolved issues: the absence of the legal status of an electronic power of attorney, the absence of the legal status of an electronic claim, the absence of a legal institution of electronic legal proceedings, the absence of an electronic legal system for conducting electronic legal proceedings, the lack of equivalence of recognition of the paper form of documents with documents in electronic form.

Conclusion

In the philosophical and legal sense the process of digital transformation of the judicial method of protecting the rights and legitimate interests of citizens and business entities in the EAEU countries allows us to identify both common and distinctive features. A common feature of this process is the adopted state programs aimed at supporting the creation of electronic justice, and the goals stated in them. Distinctive features are contained in the very process of creating e-justice in the countries under consideration (Gronic, 2022).

In the process of creating electronic justice in the Republic of Kazakhstan, a new reference and analytical service “e-Discovery” was integrated, related to the electronic disclosure of evidence, and this institution is characteristic of the countries of the Anglo-American legal system. In addition, on the basis of a single portal of public services in a single window mode, users get access to a wide range of services, including the possibility of accessing the electronic mediation procedure (Frolova & Rusakova, 2021, pp. 1842-1849). Thus, in the process of creating electronic justice, the Republic of Kazakhstan borrows the positive experience of foreign countries that have already achieved significant success in this area.

Exploring the experience of the development of electronic justice in the Republic of Armenia and the Kyrgyz Republic, the European Union plays an active role in its formation. Thus, on March 11, 2019, the European Union Program “Rule of Law in the Kyrgyz Republic-Phase 2”, together with the Supreme Court of the Kyrgyz Republic, organized for the first time in Bishkek a presentation of the “AIS of the Court” system for all judges of the first instance and all chairmen of the courts of the second instance, and in 2021 the implementation of two The annual program of the European Union “Development and implementation of e-justice solutions in Armenia”; and funding is also provided by the European Union. Consequently, issues related to the creation of electronic justice concern not only the national policy of the state, but are also of interest for the formation of the international agenda of cooperation.

Objectively, the process of implementing the creation of electronic justice in the EAEU countries is becoming important for the successful implementation of the integration agenda within the framework of the association. Perhaps it is necessary to strengthen the interaction of the EAEU countries in the process of implementing national strategies and digital development programs in order to ensure and preserve national sovereignty.

The widespread introduction of innovative digital technologies completely changes the social paradigm of society’s development. Populations that do not have access to information and communication technologies may be limited in the exercise of their rights, including judicial protection. The relevance of this process is determined by the need in modern digital society to create new opportunities to exercise one’s rights, including the right to judicial protection, to determine legal guarantees, and to maintain social equality in society.

Acknowledgement

This publication has been supported by the RUDN University Scientific Projects Grant System, project No 090222-2-000 “Development of the concept and models of digital dispute resolution in the context of creating a common information area of Eurasian Economic Union countries” (Supervisor: Frolova E.E.).
References


Ekaterina RUSAKOVA


