

Published by the decision of the Scientific Council  
of Khachatur Abovian  
Armenian State Pedagogical University



Department of Philosophy and Logic  
named after Academician Georg Brutian



# W I S D O M

4(24), 2022



*WISDOM is covered in Clarivate Analytics' Emerging Sources  
Citation Index service*

ASPU Publication

YEREVAN – 2022

## SOCIAL-PSYCHOLOGICAL AND LEGAL-PHILOSOPHICAL CHARACTERISTICS OF PERSONALITY ANOMIE

Naira HAKOBYAN<sup>1,\*</sup> | Lilit KAZANCHIAN<sup>1</sup> | Laura PETROSYAN<sup>2</sup> |  
Anna KHACHATRYAN<sup>1</sup>

1 International Scientific Educational Centre, National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Armenia

2 Public Administration Academy of the Republic of Armenia

\* Correspondence

Naira HAKOBYAN, Paronyan st.1, apt. 35, Yerevan, 0010, Armenia, E-mail: naira.hakobyan@isec.am

*Abstract:* The key to the successful and effective development of any society is the socio-psychological well-being of the population and personality, based on certain legal and philosophical concepts. Modern society experiences a kind of civilizational, philosophical, legal and socio-psychological crisis - the transformation of norms and behavior, against the background of which various forms of deviation are clearly manifested. As a result, in the context of the transformation of society, for a more complete and deeper study of the characteristics of human behavior, it becomes necessary to understand the causes of their occurrence. This methodological position allows first of all describing the mental world of a person who acts in the frames of the certain understanding and perception of social-psychological and legal norms of behavior. In this context, the procedure of psychological and legal-philosophical reconstruction of scientific concept of anomie is used as a methodological tool, which is aimed at analyzing various manifestations of the psyche of the personality and its anomic characteristics.

*Keywords:* anomie, legal-philosophical, social-psychological, social norms, value orientations, person.

### Introduction

In a modern democratic, legal, social state, in the context of the study of the interaction of the individual with society and the state, philosophical, legal, psychological studies of the concept of “anomie of personality” play an important role. According to some authors, the concept of anomie is connected with the perception of social norms and their significance.

The history of mankind gives convincing ex-

amples when violations of norms turn into destruction. Norms are mechanisms that support the social system in viable balance in the face of inevitable changes. Social norms can be formed spontaneously, for example, in the form of traditions or purposefully in the form of laws, official rules or prohibitions. Sigmund Freud (2005), the founder of psychoanalysis, believed that the normality and anomaly of each person are determined by the degree of predominance of one or another ideal type in his personality. In this

context, the concept of anomie absorbs not only psychological, but also legal and philosophical meanings. The main characteristics of anomic personality are normlessness, social isolation, subjectively perceived absence of moral rules and regulation by law.

It is noteworthy, that for a comprehensive and in-depth study of the anomie of personality, one should turn to the origins of the concept of “personality”, which is inherently multifaceted. In some cases, “personality” is characterized “as the inner definition of a single being and his independence, as possessing reason, will and a peculiar character with the unity of self-consciousness” (Brokgauz & Yefran, 1896, pp. 868-869).

In other cases, the concept of “personality” appears in two aspects: 1) in the form of a human individual, a subject of conscious activity, namely legal relations (“person” in the broad sense of the word) and 2) in the form of a fundamental system of socially important qualities that consider an individual as a member of a particular society and state. Although the terms “person” (human integrity) and “personality” (his socio-psychological appearance) are terminologically distinguishable, these concepts are often used as synonyms. In addition, the main feature of the concept of personality is that the human being is not born, but rather becomes, a person. At the same time, the concept of “personality” is a combination of both general and special socio-legal, psychological properties of a person that are realized in legal relations (Kazanchian, 2018).

### Philosophical Approach to Anomie

In modern Social-Humanitarian Sciences there are several approaches to the theory of personality anomie as a complex social, philosophical, legal and psychological phenomenon. These approaches and studies have their origins in two classical concepts formulated by E. Durkheim and R. Merton.

According to E. Durkheim, anomie appears in the form of numerous social deformations such as: the crisis of normative regulation in transitional societies (when the old system of norms and values is destroyed and the new one has not yet been established), ineffectiveness of social and moral norms as methods of regulating social

behavior, uncertainty of value-normative orientations, etc. (Lafaye, 2012).

The conducted studies indicate that anomie factors have a huge impact on the anomie of personality (Kuzmenkov, 2018). Thus, in the context of the philosophy of law and in social philosophy, it has been repeatedly emphasized that the *alienation of the individual (person)* reveals as the inability to realize oneself in society, to feel part of something big and important generates a sense of the meaninglessness of life and the uselessness of observing social norms. Moreover, *alienation also discloses* the fact, that a person is not adapted to some social norms, rejects them, or does not believe in them, and in some cases simply does not know about their existence (Antonyan, 2022).

It should be noted, that alienation is a very complex and multidimensional scientific concept, which, originating in philosophy, has left its own impact on psychology and jurisprudence. The uncertainty of a person’s social positions, the duality of his situation in society lead to alienation, which, on the one hand, can bring to life nostalgia: aspirations, desires and the impossibility of fulfilling them, and on the other hand, unfounded, overgrown expectations that contradict people’s real opportunities and real situation (Harutyunyan, 2014, p. 14).

However, the conducted research confirms the fact that alienation can be intentional (conscious) and in this case it poses an extreme danger, for example, during terrorism or riots.

In turn, modern jurists, based on R. Merton’s approach to the concept of anomie and emphasizing the contradictions between culturally set goals and the social ways by which individual achieves them, emphasize the fact that anomie of the individual leads to an increase in crime (Kuzmenkov, 2018).

Moreover, scientific and practical research emphasizes the fact that the development of the individual and society generally occurs as a result of human activity. In other words, a person is ultimately influenced by what he does and how he does it.

In particular, “activity” turns into a criterion that establishes the fundamental features, principles, and properties of a human personality. It should be noted that in the legal literature, together with the term “activity”, the terms “behavior”, “act” are often used.

Although there is no consensus in the legal literature on the relationship between these concepts, some legal scholars consider these terms as synonyms, while others, on the contrary, oppose them, distinguishing between active and reactive features, the nature of behavior and reactions to the environment.

Exploring the problems of human behavior, scientists often emphasize not only the features of the character of a given person, but also the influence of society on the behavior of an individual. S. Rubinstein rightly pointed out, that when motivation for action moves from the material, active and concrete sphere, into the sphere of personal and social relations, thereby obtaining a leading value in human actions, then human activity is filled with a new special feature (Rubinshtein, 2003, p. 362).

At the same time, human activity acquires a special meaning, which fundamentally differs from the term “behavior” in various sections of psychology, such as zoo psychology and behavioral psychology. Behavior of the individual covers a certain attitude to moral standards.

It is worth noting, that in the post-Soviet legal literature, the problems of anomie of personality remain poorly studied.

### Legal Characteristics of Anomie

Unlike Western and European jurists, who, relying on the theory of R. Merton, consider the psychologically determined causes of this phenomenon and reveal the features of this concept at the level of the individual, Post-Soviet jurists pay attention only to the socio-economic preconditions for personality anomie, which lead to deviant behavior and the growth of crime (Hagan, 2010).

*In our opinion, this approach is too restrictive, since anomie of personality is a versatile and complex phenomenon and requires interdisciplinary research. Concerning the issue of deviant behavior of the individual in the context of anomie, it should be noted that this behavior is a socially destructive consequence of anemia of the individual.*

*According to the universally recognized definition, deviant (abnormal, dysfunctional) behavior is a set of actions that contradict the norms accepted in society and manifest themselves as*

*an imbalance of mental processes, non-adaptation, a violation of the process of self-realization or evasion of moral and aesthetic control over one's behavior. Moreover, deviant (dysfunctional) behavior is defined as behavior that deliberately violates the general norms of action in a particular situation (Schaefer et al., 2016). In other words, the analysis of individual situations, the reference to anomie is convened to highlight or qualify behaviors that are not normative (i.e. “deviant”) caused by a possible disjunction between the normative social requirements and the absence of ways to realize them (Lafaye, 2012; Anheier, 2015). Usually, vitally difficult situations, the hierarchical division of society into rich and poor, frustration and a sense that life is not fair, can lead to deviant behavior of the individual: theft, physical or verbal aggression, abuse of official position, absenteeism, etc.*

Social norms can fully function in society if,

- first, there is knowledge about the current norms of both legal and social, and the sanctions imposed in case of their violation,
- secondly, a valuable attitude to existing norms is formed in the public consciousness.

Various forms of deviant behavior lead to understanding of their psychological and legal-philosophical notion. This happens in a society where the rules and values have been changed or transformed, and the laws have been preserved fragmented. Therefore, the anomie is a state not of complete chaos, but about the devaluation of all norms. From this methodological point of view, the psychological and legal-philosophical notions of this issue are investigated by Ju. Burova and E. Koval (2014).

Furthermore, the reasons why certain types of personal behavior are classified as deviant are that they have a negative impact on the participants in legal relations and can harm them.

Thus, deviance characterizes the type of undesirable behavior: theft, physical or verbal aggression, abuse of power, absenteeism, etc. This point of view reveals the typical feature of anomie as a form of deviant behavior.

### Psychological Characteristics of Personality Anomie

The psychological concept of the anomie was carefully studied by the American sociologist

and psychologist Leo Srole. He suggested viewing an anomie, especially named as an “anomia” as an individual experience and measuring the individual subjective experience of anomie (Srole, 1956). As a characteristic experience of a person living with “anomia”, he proposed five options, compliance with one of which indicates that a person has a personal “anomia”:

1. I feel that influential people in society are indifferent to my problems and needs.
2. In a society where there is no order, and no one knows what will happen tomorrow, a little can be achieved.
3. The possibilities of achieving the most important goals of life are gradually decreasing.
4. Regardless of what I do, it turns out that I in vain spend my life.
5. I am more and more convinced that I can't rely on friendly support and environment.

People at this level of consciousness are alienated and isolated from society, looking for a solution to all their problems in thoughts, where the idea of their own guilt is completely absent.

The psychological concept of the anomie was additionally developed by M. MacIver, D. Riesman and other authors (MacIver & Riesman, 1950). The “psychological anomia”, according to the M. MacIver, is such a state of personality when a person breaks out of his moral roots and has no more behavioral norms, as a result of which only scattered motives and incomplete ideas about unity remain (Kara-Murza, 2013).

M. MacIver distinguishes three types of personal anomia:

1. When a person's life becomes aimless due to the lack of important values;
2. When a person uses energy and opportunities only for his own well-being;
3. When a person is deprived of interpersonal connections and relationships.

American sociologist David Riesman believed that anomie is an inability to live in society. According to his observation, in any society there are people with “external”, “internal” or “traditional” value orientations. He, who cannot adapt to common and dominant norms and value orientations in society, becomes anomic. If the leading goals in modern society are financial success, glory and victory in the competition with others, then in such a society those who have external orientation find their place. Others, whose orientation is traditional or internal, feel

lonely, because they feel like strangers in a world whose values they do not share (Geary, 2013).

Anomie, as an individual state of man, was studied by an American sociologist and public figure Elvin Powell. He noted that in conditions when the goals of human activity become contradictory, unattainable or insignificant, the state of the anomia worsens. It is characterized by a general loss of value orientation and is accompanied by a feeling of “emptiness” and apathy, as a result of which a person can feel simply meaningless and empty loneliness (Powell, 1958).

The German sociologist, philosopher and social psychologist Erich Fromm gave another significant characteristic of the manifestation of anomia at a catastrophic level, given that the main indicator of the disease of society is indifference to a person. In this regard, the anomic results presented by E. Fromm (1994) are observed during the manifestation of such phenomena as “narcissism”, “necrophilia”, “sadism”, “masochism”, etc.

The author of the concept of individual anomie is the American sociologist Robert Agnew, whose theory is based on the idea of Merton that the emergence of social and psychological tension in humans reduces the need to use legal means to achieve their goals, as a result of which illegal means of achieving the goal become more demanded (Merton, 1938). M. Merton investigated the anomie, in particular, from the standpoint of achieving economic success. The peculiarity of actualization of the socio-economic context is determined by the requirements of the time where the process of socialization of the personality, its promotion on the damage of social stratification was largely dependent on economic success. It is not surprising that contemporaries of the era of scientific and economic progress, including M. Merton, were based in their scientific researches on the concept of using effective means to achieve any goal. According to M. Merton, these funds can be both legal and illegal. The use of illegal means to achieve the intended goal enhances the structural stratification of society, since not everyone has access to legal means to achieve success. Thus, many authors - E. Durkheim, M. Merton, R. Agnew, others, emphasized the inconsistency of the postponed goal by the presence of legal means to achieve it. The consequence of this is the weakening of cultural norms in society, which, in turn,



leads to an increase in crime and to anomie. It is also interesting that in the modern conditions of globalization of society the views of M. Merton and his followers regarding the connection between the limited use of legal means to achieve the goal and socio-cultural stratification of society are increasingly finding confirmation in modern psychological studies related to the anomic behavior of the individuals (De Winter & Dodou, 2012; Hornsey & Hogg, 2000; Levin & Cross, 2004).

One of the most interesting modern attempts to modify Merton's classical theory of anomie is the general theory of tension of Robert Agnew (2006). R. Agnew created a "general theory of tension", which presents various sources of socio-psychological tension, including the inconsistency of the goals and means of achieving them. At an individual level, the source of anomic tension is always associated with a negative attitude towards other people, in other words, a relationship in which a person is not perceived as he would like to be.

The general theory of tension significantly advances the socio-structural understanding and explanation of the nature of deviant behavior on a number of aspects, ensuring more complete coverage of cognitive, behavioral and emotional components of individuals to tension in the social system.

The classical anomic theory and its subsequent versions in the works of various authors suggest that tension is the result of the inability of the personality or groups to achieve goals socially approved in society. The theory of Agnew proceeds from the fact that deviation is a way of adaptation to stress that occurs during various stress options. He identifies several types of tension caused by the negative relations of the individual with other people. Stress may be the result of the following:

- a refusal or inability to achieve the desired and positively assessed goals,
- elimination of positive or desirable incentives for the person,
- creation negatively perceived incentives.

Therefore, the theory of tension expands the range of possible tensions arising in relations between people. For example, tension may be appearing when the ways to achieve the goal (external prohibitions, the mismatch of individual abilities and skills) are blocked, they act unjust or

dishonest with the individual; when he experiences serious losses (loss of a loved one, exclusion from the group); when stress arises due to negative relations with parents, teachers and friends. So, if a teenager has serious problems in the family or school, and normal ways to avoid tension in relations with other persons are blocked, then this circumstance gives rise to negative emotions and stresses.

The neutralization of depression, fear, anger, frustration of one of the possible reactions may be the commission of a crime or other deviant behavior. A deviant reaction is a way to reduce stress to achieve the desired goals, protection, gaining positive incentives or evading negative experiences. In this sense, all kinds of deviation are possible, depending on what personal qualities the individual has, to what extent he is integrated into the group, what is the level of his socialization. Thus, the socio-structural approach is presented through the perception of legality - on the one hand, and the possibilities - on the other one, of means using to achieve the goal. This approach is realized in the theory of tension, which allows you to better understand the features of socio-psychological factors of deviant behavior. Such behavior is considered as a result of the inability of an individual or group to achieve goals socially approved in society, as a way of deviant adaptation to the problems and other realities of modern society. Summarizing, we can note that the terms of tension and anomie are not identical, however, the deepening of tension can lead to anomie.

Another socio-psychological phenomenon manifested in an anomic society is apathy. Translated from the Greek language, apathy means a state of impassivity and indifference, which is characterized by emotional passivity, indifference to environmental events, weakening of motives and interests.

At the individual level, apathy is manifested by noticeable infantilism (suspension of the development of the body, in which a person retains children's features of physical and mental development in adulthood), a deviation from interpersonal communication to virtual reality. Modern communication and information capabilities, on the one hand, save the time of a person, which allows him to overcome spatial and temporary boundaries, on the other hand, they deprive him of a sense of reality, thoughtful thinking and the

ability to coordinate their own activities. As a result of this fictional reality, everyday life is violated, and the sense of reality is lost. At a personal level, moral indifference becomes characteristic of anomic society (Hakobyan et al., 2022).

The essential characteristic of the concept of anomie, as we can see, is the concept of social apathy, which contributes to the understanding and explanation of the dominant aspect of social well-being. Therefore, it seems legitimate to refer to its analysis: characterizing the origin and dynamics of the context of use.

Despite the frequent use of the concept of apathy in scientific works, in modern socio-philosophical thought there are extremely few specific studies regarding such a complex social phenomenon. In psychology, apathy is mainly considered as a mental state of loss of interest in life and a kind of emotional decline caused by fatigue, stress or internal conflicts of the individual. Apathy proceeds against a background of reduced physical and psychological activity, apathy can be short-term or long-term. Social apathy today is considered by various authors mainly as existential, social and psychological problem.

We believe that this concept is applicable both for an individual psychological characteristic or personality state, and to denote a common objectified social line that characterizes certain anomic transformations of modern society. These transformations are often manifested through:

- changes in the value system,
- inconsistencies of social behavior by cultural, social and legal norms adopted in society,
- social stratification or polarization of society,
- maintaining tension in interpersonal relationships,
- the prevalence of various forms of deviation,
- deepening a sense of uncertainty,
- depreciation of significant norms of behavior (Hezemans et al., 2020; Zhelnina, 2020).

The use of the concept of “social apathy” will also allow us to consider the problems of anomie at another, more global, interdisciplinary level. In other words, social apathy is seen as legal-philosophical and psychosocial characteristics of the concept of anomie.

Another important feature of our time is the spread of impersonal values when we are talking about “non-heroic times” or “anti-heroes”. This situation is associated with the lack of ideals, the

uncertainty of moral choice, the absence or incomplete assimilation of behavioral models approved by society, which sooner or later lead to the manifestation of anomia. One of the most insidious realities of our time is the anti-hero syndrome, which destroys all existing ideas and values. Anti-heroes have become examples for imitation for a large number of young people. It is no coincidence that a distorted understanding of the image of men and women, which is captured in the minds of young people, leads to such a distortion of values (Burova & Koval, 2014).

In the discipline of psychology, a personal crisis can also lead to anomie, as a result of which a person’s belief system reorganizes, which radically changes person’s moral and normative attitude to life. Throughout his life, a person may face various problems and crises. Some of them are associated with the development of man at different stages of life. In other words, the normal, natural phenomena occur in the life of each person and distinguish between the transitions from one stage of life to another (Napso, 2017, p. 42).

Any “natural” event in a person’s life (marriage, the birth of a child, a school, the death of a relative, illness, etc.) and his consequences inevitably cause a certain problem situation or crisis, which requires a person to mobilize his own resources. They are called normative stress. This issue was investigated fully by T. Parsons too. The behavior of adolescents and young people in the light of the concept of anomie: a state in which values and norms are no longer clear indicators of the corresponding behavior or have lost their significance (Parsons, 2006).

## Conclusion

Thus, we can say that anomie in legal-philosophical point of view is presented as a form of antisocial behavior and continuous decay of the value system. In this context, it becomes important to interpret the concept of a social norm, which acts as a starting point for studying any deviation. According to a common definition, deviant behavior is a deviation from social norms, because one of the main conditions for the existence of any system is its ability to form and maintain social norms of behavior that support the social system in a certain state of bal-

ance. This characteristic is also presented by social-psychological concept of anomie which emphasizes individual features of disadaptation in society.

### Acknowledgement

The work was supported by the Science Committee of the Republic of Armenia, in the frames of the research project № 21T-5A311.

### References

- Agnew, R. (2006). *Pressured into crime: An overview of general strain theory*. Los Angeles: Roxbury Publication.
- Anheier, H. (2015). Institutions and infrastructure of the social and behavioral sciences. In *International encyclopedia of the social & behavioral sciences* (pp. 59-66). (2<sup>nd</sup> ed). Elsevier.
- Antonyan, Y. (2022). *Otchuzhdeniye lichnosti kak prichina prestupnosti* (Alienation of the individual as a cause of crime, in Russian). *Obshchestvo i pravo* (Society and Law, in Russian), 2(8), 8-19.
- Brokgauz, F., & Yefran, I. (1896). *Entsiklopedicheskiy slovar* (Encyclopedic dictionary, in Russian). (Vol. XVII). Saint Petersburg: Semenovskaya Tipolitografiya I.A. Yefrona.
- Burova, Ju., & Koval, E. (2014). *Normativnye osnovaniya mekhanizmov preodoleniya dezadaptatsii sovremennoy molodyoji v usloviakh social'noy anomii* (Mechanisms of normative basis of modern youth desadaptation overcoming in the conditions of social anomie, in Russian). Saransk: Krasniy oktyabr Publication.
- De Winter, J., & Dodou, D. (2012). Factor recovery by principal axis factoring and maximum likelihood factor analysis as a function of factor pattern and sample size. *Journal of Applied Statistics*, 39(4), 695-710.
- Freud, S. (2005). *Massenpsychologie und Ich-Analyse. Die Zukunft einer Illusion* (Group psychology and the analysis of the ego: The future of an illusion, in German). Frankfurt-on-Main: Fischer Verlag Publication.
- Fromm, E. (1994). *The anatomy of human destructiveness*. New York: Holt Rinehart & Winston Publication.
- Geary, D. (2013). Children of the lonely crowd: David Riesman, the young radicals, and the splitting of liberalism in the 1960s. *Modern Intellectual History*, 10(3), 603-633.
- Hagan, F. (2010). *Introduction to criminology: Theories, methods, and criminal behavior*. New York: SAGE Publication.
- Hakobyan, N., Gevorgyan, S., Petrosyan, L., & Khachatryan, A. (2022). The problem of personal development in the context of social anomie. *WISDOM*, 2(22), 7-14. <https://doi.org/10.24234/wisdom.v-22i2.749>
- Harutyunyan, M. (2014). *Ardi hay hasarakut'yuny yev otarvats gitaktsutyany pilisopayut'yuny* (Modern Armenian society and the philosophy of alienated consciousness, in Armenian). Yerevan: Nairi.
- Hezemans, F. H., Wolpe, N., & Rowe, J. B. (2020). Apathy is associated with reduced precision of prior beliefs about action outcomes. *Journal of Experimental Psychology: General*, 149(9), 1767-1777.
- Hornsey, M., & Hogg, M. (2000). Assimilation and diversity: An integrative model of subgroup relations. *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, 4(2), 143-56.
- Kara-Murza, S. (2013). *Anomiya v Rossii: prichini i proyavleniya* (Anomie in Russia: Causes and manifestations, in Russian). Moscow: Nauchniy expert Publication.
- Kazanchian, L. (2018). *Ponyatiye "lichnost'" v kontekste pravovogo polozheniya lichnosti* (The concept of "personality" in the context of the legal status of the individual, in Russian). *Yevraziyskiy yuridicheskiy zhurnal (Eurasian Law Journal, in Russian)*, 1(116), 100-101.
- Kuzmenkov, V. (2018). Lichnostnyye faktory anomii (Personal factors of anomie, in Russian). *Intellekt. Innovatsii. Investitsii (Intellect. Innovation. Investments, in Russian)*, 7, 71-74.
- Lafaye, C. (2012). Anomie, exclusion, désaffi-



- liation: Dissolution de la cohésion sociale ou du lien social? *Pensée Plurielle*, 1(29), 11-35.
- Levin, D., & Cross, R. (2004). The strength of weak ties you can trust: The mediating role of trust in effective knowledge transfer. *Management Science*, 50(11), 1477-1490.
- MacIver, M., & Riesman, D. (1950). *The ramps we guard*. New York: Macmillan Company Publication.
- Merton, R. (1938, October). Social structure and anomie. *American Sociological Review*, 3(5), 672-682. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2084686>
- Napso, M. (2017). *Teoria anomii E. Durkheima i sovremennost'* (Theory of anomie of E. Durkheim and modernity, in Russian). *Sociodinamika (Sociodynamics, in Russian)*, 2, 22-30.
- Parsons, T. (2006). The sociology of knowledge and the history of ideas. In H. Staubmann (Ed.), *Action theory: Methodological studies* (pp. 31-82). LIT Verlag, Wien Publication.
- Powell, E. (1958). Occupation, status and suicide: Toward a redefinition of anomie. *American Sociological Review*, 23( 2), 131-139.
- Rubinshtein, S. (2003). *Bytiye i soznaniye. Chelovek i mir* (Being and consciousness. Man and the world, in Russian). Sankt-Peterburg: Pite.
- Schaeffers, T., Wittkowski, K., Benoit, S., & Ferraro, R. (2016). Contagious effects of customer misbehavior in access-based services. *Journal of Service Research*, 19(1), 3-21.
- Srole, L. (1956). Social integration and certain corollaries: An exploratory study. *American Sociological Review*, 21, 709-716.
- Zhel'nina, A. (2020). The apathy syndrome: How we are trained not to care about politics. *Social Problems*, 67(2), 358-378.